

## Hermeneutics of *hadith* about music: Fazlur Rahman dan Khaled M. Aboue el Fadl

Hibatul Wafi<sup>1</sup>, Rahil Ayu Na Ziihah<sup>2</sup>, Zainal Arifin<sup>3</sup>, Filyatul Mujahidah<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1,2,3,4</sup> Universitas Islam Negeri Yogyakarta, Indonesia

Correspondence: [hibatulafi261197@gmail.com](mailto:hibatulafi261197@gmail.com)

DOI: 10.29240/alquds.v8.2.8081

Submitted: 2023-07-23 | Revised: 2024-09-02 | Accepted: 2024-09-02

**Abstract.** *Hadith regarding music in the neomodern era became the focus of Muslims, where there were many negative things or deviated from Muslims in consuming music so many Muslims assumed that consuming music in life was something that was unlawful. Using the hermeneutical approach of Fazlur Rahman and Khalid about El-Fadl, a study will be carried out to interpret hadiths about music. This research is a literature review that aims to interpret the hadith about music with the hermeneutics of Fazlur Rahman and Khalid about El-Fadl. The primary source in this research is the hadith about music. In addition, the secondary sources used are in the form of several books and journal articles that have the same research focus. Reinterpretation of hadith based on Fazlur Rahman and Khalid M. Aboue El-Fadl's hermeneutics is generally carried out with three aspects, namely the meaning of hadith texts, a socio-historical approach and interpretation of hadiths. The result of the reinterpretation of the hadith about music is to provide a law that music is permissible within the limits of Islamic law.*

**Keywords.** *Music, Hadith about Music; Fazlur Rahman; Khaled Mob. Abou El-Fadl;*

### Introduction

The art of music is in a dilemma for Islamic society in the neomodern era. The reason is that it is among the assumptions that give a negative connotation.<sup>1</sup> because of neglect, making opium, even not a few music whose lyrics are equivalent to Islamic teachings.<sup>2</sup> It is also based on the assumption that gives a positive connotation to music which plays an active role as a medium of Islamic da'wah in Indonesia,<sup>3</sup> as a teaching method<sup>4</sup>. In fact, as a means of relaxation and soul therapy.<sup>5</sup>

The law of music has also become a prolonged debate and controversy among scholars.<sup>6</sup> There are many opinions of scholars about music law, including the opinion that music law is absolutely halal, there are also those who think that it is halal with conditions, as well as absolute haram or haram with conditions.<sup>7</sup> This difference of opinion is natural, because in general almost all *furu'* issues of scholars have various legal views, this happens because of differences in contextual

<sup>1</sup> Andre Indrawan, "Music in the Islamic World: A Musicological Historical Exploration," *Journal of Islamic Cultural Arts Studies* 1, no. 1 (2012): 38–54.

<sup>2</sup> Fahrul Husni, "The Law of Listening to Music (A Study of the Opinion of Fiqh Shafi'iyah)," *Sharia Journal* 8, no. 2 (2019): 24–48.

<sup>3</sup> Muklish Aliyudin and Ratna Dewi Tanty Sri Wulandari, "Music as a Da'wah Media," *Tabligh: Journal of Islamic Teaching* 4, no. 4 (2019): 448–66.

<sup>4</sup> Irine Kurniastuti, Bayu Prayogo, dan Vinsencius, "AS A FUN LEARNING MEDIA FOR SECOND-GRADE ELEMENTARY," *IJET International Journal of Indonesian Education and Teaching* 6, no. 1 (2021): 25–38.

<sup>5</sup> Nur Sayyid et al., "Systematic Review A Systematic Review of Effectiveness of Music Therapy on Depression In The Elderly," *Nurse's Journal* 15, no. 2 (2020).

<sup>6</sup> Saifuddin Zuhri Qudsy, "The Contestation of Hadith Memes on the Prohibition of Music," *Journal of Hadith Studies* 2, no. 1 (2019): 23–36.

<sup>7</sup> Husni, "The Law of Listening to Music (A Study of the Opinion of Fiqh Shafi'iyah)."

understanding, assessment of the degree of hadith, postulates of rules, methodologies for drawing legal conclusions.<sup>8</sup>

The existence of a sahih hadith that allows music makes an enigma for ordinary people who see music from its negative connotations.<sup>9</sup> Moreover, in the developing digital age, where many applications on Android such as tik tok, Instagram, Youtube and other applications that do not escape music as a feature make music consumption difficult to avoid, but it is not uncommon to use it for things that tend to be negative. In this case, it is necessary to study the hadith related to calibrating the frequency of the development of the times.

Hermeneutics is an approach to interpret the content and meaning of a text by looking at historical aspects and conditions.<sup>10</sup> This approach has several figures and methods in its application, such as Fazlur Rahman with his *double movement method*, Khalid about El-Fadl with his hermeneutics of negotiation. Although it has several figures and their methods, in essence the main concept of hermeunatics remains the same. This approach can also be used to study musical hadith by understanding the meaning of the hadith textually and contextually in the *social setting* in the time of the Prophet and pulling it back to the current situation.<sup>11</sup>

There are several previous studies that discuss musical hadith, such as the analysis of singing hadith with the study of the hermeneutics of Muhammad Al-Ghazali in the Book of Al-Sunnah Al-Nabawiyah.<sup>12</sup> A Study on the Law of Listening to Music from the Perspective of Shafi'iyah Scholars<sup>13</sup>. Then, the study of the law of music is based on a comparison of the thoughts of Ibn Ḥazm and Shafi'.<sup>14</sup> From several previous studies that discussed hadith about music, it turns out that there has been no research that examines the hermeneutics of music hadith from the perspective of Fazlur Rahman and Khalid M. About El-Fadl, so if researchers need to study related matters.

This research is a qualitative research in the form of library *research*. Literature Study is a research method by collecting data by understanding every theory and literature related to the object of research.<sup>15</sup> The formal object of this research is the hadiths related to the law of music. Meanwhile, the material object in this study consists of several books and scientific journal articles related to the discussion in the research. Meanwhile, the procedure carried out in this study is to

<sup>8</sup> Mohammad Hanief Sirajulhuda, "Konsep Fikih Ikhtilaf Yusuf al-Qaradhawi," *Tsaqafah Journal of Islamic Civilization* 13, no. 2 (2017): 255–78.

<sup>9</sup> Hasnul Fikri dan Ade Sri Madona, *Development of Interactive Multimedia-Based Learning Media*, Print Pe, vol. 21 (Yogyakarta: Samudra Biru (IKAPI Member), 2020), <http://journal.um-surabaya.ac.id/index.php/JKM/article/view/2203>.

<sup>10</sup> S Suwardi and M Syaifullah, "Various Hermeneutic Approaches in Islamic Studies: A Literature Study," *Acta Islamica Counsenesia ...* 2, no. 1 (2022): 51–60.

<sup>11</sup> Faiq Ainurrofiq, "Use Of Hermeneutics Double Movement Fazlur Rahman In Comprehending Hadith Of The Unsuccessful Leadership Of Women," *Journal Ushuluddin* Vol. 27 No, no. 1 (2019): 5–10, <https://doi.org/10.24014/J>.

<sup>12</sup> Ihsan Nurmansyah, "A Hermeneutic Study in the Book of Al-Sunnah Al-Nabawiyah by Muhammad Al-Ghazali: An Analysis of Hadith on Singing," *Journal Al-Irfani: Studi Al-Qur' An and Tafsir* 2, no. 1 (2021): 1–13, <https://doi.org/10.51700/irfani>.

<sup>13</sup> Husni, "The Law of Listening to Music (A Study of the Opinion of Fiqh Shafi'iyah)."

<sup>14</sup> Muhammad Yusram et al., "A Comparative Analysis of Ibn Hazm and Shafi'i's Thought on the Law of Music," *Bustanul Fuqaha Journal of Islamic Law* 1, no. 4 (2020): 627–49, <https://doi.org/10.36701/bustanul.v1i4.280>.

<sup>15</sup> Muhammad Rijal Fadli, "Understanding the design of qualitative research methods," *Humanika* 21, no. 1 (2021): 33–54, <https://doi.org/10.21831/hum.v21i1.38075>.

begin by determining the hadiths that discuss music, then interpretation is carried out using the hermeneutic theory of the perspective of Fazlur Rahman and Khaled M. Abou el-Fadl.

## Discussion

Fazlur Rahman is a neomodernist figure who was born in Hazara Pakistan in 1919. Rahman was born into an educated family. He has a father named Maulana Syahab al-Din and is a traditional scholar who follows the madhhab Imam Hanafi, an alumnus of Deoband High School, who directly guides Rahman in memorizing the Qur'an. In addition, also taught Rahman various linguistic and religious sciences, such as Persian and Arabic, literature, rhetoric, literature, philosophy of religious science, interpretation of hadith and the Qur'an, and the science of kalam.<sup>16</sup> Rahman's intellectual journey began when he was 14 years old studying in a modern educational institution in Lahore, then continued with higher education at the University of Punjab taking an Arabic literature study program and graduated in 1940, In addition, he also took a master's education at the same campus and graduated in 1942. Rahman continued his doctoral studies at the University of Oxford in literature until 1950.<sup>17</sup> After receiving his doctorate, he did not return to Pakistan immediately, but he chose to teach at Durham University in the United Kingdom and McGill University, Motreal, Canada.<sup>18</sup>

In 1960, he chose to return to Pakistan to become a director of the Institute of Islamic Research and a member of the Institute of Islamic Research. *Advisory Council of Islamic Ideology*.<sup>19</sup> However, rahman's thoughts about the sunnah of hadith, riba, zakat, bank riba, and, halal, and the haram of slaughtering animals using machines. This resulted in a nationwide controversy in Pakistan, especially after his monumental work, *Islam*, a book that stated that the Qur'an as a whole was the word of Allah and in the ordinary sense was also the words of Muhammad became the culmination of the traditionalist public's disagreement and anger towards him. This situation forced Rahman and his family to leave Pakistan and continue his career in Chicago until the end of his life.<sup>20</sup>

### ***Khaled M. Abou El Fadl's Biography***

Abou El Fadl is one of the leading hermeneutics scientists who was born in Kuwait in 1963 and has the full name Khaled Medhat Abou El Fadl. He has completed his primary and secondary education in his homeland, Kuwait.<sup>21</sup> Abou El Fadl comes from a religious family. His father, Medhat Abou El Fadl, was a scholar of Islamic law and was very influential in his life. Meanwhile,

---

<sup>16</sup> Iain Palangka Raya et al., "The Thoughts of Fazlur Rahman and Muhammad Arkoun Ajahari," *Journal of Religious and Community Studies* 12 (2016): 232–62.

<sup>17</sup> Muhammad Yusuf dan Anwar Sadat, "Fazlur Rahman's Double Movement and Its Contribution to the Development of Religious Moderation," *IJISH (International Journal of Islamic Studies and Humanities)* 4, no. 1 (2021): 51–71.

<sup>18</sup> Wely Dozan, "As a Method of Interpretation of the Qur'an (Theory, Tracing Fazlurrahman, Hermeneutics)," *El-Hikam: Journal of Islamic Education and Studies* XII, no. 1 (2019): 155–81.

<sup>19</sup> Burhanuddin Iai, Hamzanwadi Nw, and East Lombok, "Polygamy from the Hermeneutic Perspective of Fazlur Rahman," *As-Sabiqun : Journal of Early Childhood Islamic Education* 1 (2019): 71–88.

<sup>20</sup> Alma'arif, "Hermeneutika hadith ala fazlur rahman," *Journal of the Study of the Sciences of the Qur'an and Hadith* 16, no. 2 (2015): 243–64.

<sup>21</sup> Ahmad Suhendra, "Ahmad Suhendra STAI Binamadani Tangerang," *Mutawâtir: Scientific Journal of Hadith Interpretation* 5, no. 2 (2015): 412–13.

his mother is a mother who always teaches him to read the Qur'an as every morning he is woken up by his mother Afaf El Nirm with the chanting of the holy verses of the Qur'an.<sup>22</sup>

Abou El Fadl has been known since his childhood as a smart child. Khaled at a young age had studied various kinds of religious sciences, such as Qur'an, hadith, tafsir and Sufism, as well as Arabic. As a teenager, he memorized the Qur'an at the age of 12.<sup>23</sup> In addition, at a relatively young age, he had carried out religious education at a madrassa in Al-Azhar (Egypt) which at that time was undergoing a transition process from moderate ideology to Wahhabi. The belief that he held firmly until he stepped into adolescence changed drastically to 180 degrees. This happens because there is a criticism of understanding non-discretion and arbitrary actions.<sup>24</sup>

In 1982, he left Egypt and continued his studies at Yale University in the United States by studying law for four years and graduating with honors *cumlaude*. Then, in 1989, Khaled continued his Master of Laws studies at the University of Pennsylvania and graduated with satisfactory results. Therefore, for his achievements, he was accepted to serve in the Superior Court of Justice of Arizona as an attorney in the field of commercial law and immigration law. Thus, Khaled obtained naturalization as an American citizen and was trusted as one of the academic staff at the University of Texas at Austin. After that, he continued his education to get a doctorate at the University of Princeton in 1999. The doctoral degree he received is a bachelor in the field of Islamic law obtained from the School of Law University of California, Los Angeles UCCLA and Khaled has also been a professor in the field of Islamic law, (Rohmanu, 2017).

Abou El Fadl as a scientist and activist has published many of his scientific works, among others, as follows:

*The Place of Tolerance in Islam (Cambridge University, 2001), Islam and The Challenge of Democracy (Princeton University Press, 2004), Fighting God's Army (translation and God Knows the Soldiers: The authoritative and Authoritarian in Islamic Discourse (2001). Book deliberation: tracing the beauty of Islam from Book to Book (translation from Confernces of the Books: The Search for the Beauty in Islam (2001), and The authoritarian and authoritarian In Islamic Discourse (2001), (Pakpahan et al., 2021).*

Abou El Fadl's writings are not only in the form of books. However, he has written many kinds of scientific journal articles and lecture books that cannot be counted.<sup>25</sup> It is known that Khaled Abou El-Fadl has created 14 books and scientific journal articles from various topics in Islam along with Islamic law according to the UCLA website *School of Law Los Angels California*. His extensive knowledge and scientific approach to the perspective of Islamic morality made him a scientist to remember.<sup>26</sup>

<sup>22</sup> Moh. Wardi, "Hermeneutics of Khaled Abou El Fadl; A Contribution of Thought in Islamic Studies," *al-Ulum: Islamic University of Madura* 1, no. 1 (2014): 1–8.

<sup>23</sup> Muhammad Lutfi Hakim, "Hermeneutic-Negotiation in the Study of Religious Fatwas: A Critical Analysis of Khaled M. Abou El Fadl's Thought," *Istinbath* 19, no. 1 (2020): 27–52, <https://doi.org/10.20414/ijhi.v19i1.204>.

<sup>24</sup> M Taufiq and Muhammad Ilham, "The Hermeneutic Thought of Khaled M. Abou El Fadl: From Authoritarian Fiqh to Authoritative Fiqh," *TAQNIN: Sharia and Law Journal* 3, no. 1 (2021): 66–79, <https://doi.org/10.30821/taqnin.v3i01.9514>.

<sup>25</sup> Taufiq and Ilham.

<sup>26</sup> Abdulloh Hanif, "A Deconstructive Review of Khaled M. Abou El-Fadl's Concept of Authority," *Reflection: Journal of Islamic Philosophy and Thought* 20, no. 1 (2020): 25, <https://doi.org/10.14421/ref.2020.2001-02>.

### ***Double Movement Theory Perspective Fazlur Rahman***

Ignaz Godziher's theory which states the invalidity of the truth of the hadith that has a connection with the Prophet and the generation of the Prophet's companions. According to Godziher, hadith is only a recording and view that is generalizing in the time of the Prophet and the Companions, and is only intended for the benefit of the Islamic community during the development of Islam. Because of this, it moved Fazlur Rahman to spawn the double movement theory as a form of disagreement with the theory initiated by Godhizer.<sup>27</sup>

The hermeunetic double movement initiated by Fazlur Rahman was built on the principle of hermeunetic dilthey. Based on heremenu, Dilthey in interpreting a hadith requires an assessment of the historical, social, contemporary and anthropological aspects of the past and present society.<sup>28</sup> Meanwhile, in interpreting the hadith, Rahman uses inductive and deductive thinking patterns with a reference to the hybrid method, namely by understanding the text first and connecting it with its contextual meaning so that it can provide an understanding that is not only textually standard, but can be understood metathetically.<sup>29</sup>

The Double Movement theory or the double movement theory initiated by Fazlur Rahman is a logical, critical, and comprehensive method of hadith hermeunics.<sup>30</sup> In fact, it has two movements, among them: the first movement, from special to general.<sup>31</sup> The movement started from a specific point and then drew it into general principles and long-term moral values by understanding the text of the hadith as well as examining the history of the law (*asbabul wurud*) which is sourced from the Prophet by understanding the background of the historical situation and social settings.<sup>32</sup> Then, the mufassir generalized the message that the hadith wanted to convey.<sup>33</sup>

The second movement, from general to special (Wahdah, 2021), is to start from general principles that are drawn to a specific view and formulated and realized into modern life (Hamzawi, 2016) or by re-growing the teachings and laws obtained from the first movement on the basis of moral ideal principles that are applicable and adaptive to the sociological background in today's era without violating the principles in general.<sup>34</sup> This strategy was laid out by Rahman with the intention of combining the historical approach with the sociological approach.

### ***Theory Hermeneutika Perspective Khaled Muhammad Abou El Fadl***

Khaled M. Abou El Fadl is one of the contemporary Islamic thinkers who questions the relationship between humans and revelation. Khaled M. Abou El. Fadl, (Sofyan, 2015) initiated a model of reading religious texts that he considered authoritative. Researchers call it an authoritative form of hermeneutics or what is often referred to as negoitative. The procedure of the hermeneutic approach initiated by Khaled M. Abou El Fadl is to determine the relationship between the text or

<sup>27</sup> D S Kurniawan, "Hermeneutic Approach in Hadith Studies: (Theory of A Double Movement of Fazlur Rahman)," *ULIL ALBAB: A Multidisciplinary Scientific Journal* 1, no. 4 (2022): 705–11.

<sup>28</sup> Y A Wahdah, "Hermeneutika Double Movement Fazlur Rahman Dalam Studi Hadits," *Journal of Al Quran and Hadith Studies* 2, no. 1 (2021): 30–43.

<sup>29</sup> Sugianto Sugianto, "Hermeneutics: Methods in Understanding the Hadith of Fazlur Rahman's Perspective," *Alfiyah: Journal of Social and Religious Affairs* 3, no. 2 (2019): 47, <https://doi.org/10.31958/jsk.v3i2.1693>.

<sup>30</sup> Ana Rahmawati, "Forms of Syntactic Interference of Indonesian in Arabic," *Ijaz Arabi Journal of Arabic Learning* 1, no. 2 (2018): 122–29, <https://doi.org/10.18860/ijazarabi.v1i2.5416>.

<sup>31</sup> Wahdah, "Hermeneutics of Fazlur Rahman's Double Movement in the Study of Hadith."

<sup>32</sup> Kurniawan, "Hermeneutic Approach in Hadith Studies: (Fazlur Rahman's A Double Movement Theory)."

<sup>33</sup> Adib Hamzawi, "The Elasticity of Islamic Law; Fazlur Rahman's Double Movement Theory Study," *INNOVATIVE: Journal of Educational, Religious and Cultural Research* 2, no. 2 (2016): 1–25.

<sup>34</sup> Kurniawan, "Hermeneutic Approach in Hadith Studies: (Fazlur Rahman's A Double Movement Theory)."

the text, the author or author (*author*), and readers (*Reader*) in the dynamics of the struggle of Islamic law in particular and in general, (Fadl, 2004). The model in authoritative or negotiative hermeneutics is to interpret meaning in a complex way between authors, texts, and readers in debating, dialoging, a meaning of a text that is constantly changing.<sup>35</sup>

Khaled's starting point created authoritative hermeneutics, because of the modern phenomenon found today, namely there is a strong tendency by religious people to take over the author's authority, in this case divine authority. Thus, it is easy for religious people to make decisions in justifying the arbitrary behavior of readers (*Reader*) which is absolute to texts (*Nas*) religious.<sup>36</sup>

The concept of interpretation of meaning initiated by Khaled consists of three stages of understanding, namely the first possibility that the meaning of a text is determined directly by the author in understanding the meaning conveyed in a text. However, the meaning of a text by the author does not require a reader to believe in the meaning that has been determined.<sup>37</sup> Hadith is an authoritative text that has a high position and is parallel to the Qur'an as the message of God and His will. However, Khaled explained to abandon textual authoritarianism, because if the Qur'an and hadith are assumed to be self-spoke religious texts, then the Qur'an and hadith are the only authority holders.<sup>38</sup>

The second possibility is that the determination of meaning is centered on the text itself and is autonomous in the disconnection of a meaning. As explained by Umberto Eco, that the text has an integrity that deserves to be respected and a reader (*Reader*) must not use text freely indefinitely. Therefore, a text has an entity in its relevance to its history and context.<sup>39</sup>

The third possibility is the assignment of meaning to the reader. This can be interpreted as all readers bringing subjectivity in the process of reading a text which is then implicated by the subjectivity of the author's will and the text. Therefore, in understanding the entire meaning of a text, the reader needs to examine the relationship between historical reality and its context. In the process of interpretation, it is carried out based on historical, social, political and subjective perspectives that are contextual.<sup>40</sup> Reader (*Reader*) is in a position to play an important role in the creation of meaning, as a form of preventing authoritarianism (*author*) and the arbitrary attitude of the interpreter/reader (*Reader*) in establishing a meaning that gives rise to an interpretation that is free without limits.<sup>41</sup>

As explained earlier, Khaled said that the Qur'an is an autonomous, open and free text. However, he felt the need for a restriction of authoritarianism on readers (*Reader*) who became

<sup>35</sup> Muhammad Sofyan, "Khaled Abou El-Fadl," *Kalam: Journal of Religious Studies and Islamic Thought* 9, no. 2 (2015): 373–92.

<sup>36</sup> Khaled M. Abou El Fadl, *In the Name of God from Authoritarian Fiqh to Authoritative Fiqh*, ed. by Cecep Lukman Yasin, Cet. 1 (Jakarta: PT Serambi Ilmu semesta, 2004).

<sup>37</sup> Fadl. Thing. 183

<sup>38</sup> Alfi Qonita Badi'ati, "Criticism of Textual Authoritarianism with a Hermeneutic Knife; A Study on Khaled M Abou Khaled's Thought," *INJECT (Interdisciplinary Journal of Communication)* 1, no. 1 (2016): 43, <https://doi.org/10.18326/inject.v1i1.673>.

<sup>39</sup> Fadl, *In the Name of God from Authoritarian Fiqh to Authoritative Fiqh*. Thing. 184

<sup>40</sup> Fadl. Thing. 185

<sup>41</sup> Erizka Putri Bellyta Muhammad Abduh, "Khaled M. Abou El Fadl: Towards an Authoritative Reading of the Prophet's Hadith Through Negotiative Hermeneutics," *Tabdis* 12, no. 1 (2021): 116–31.

God's representative, with five conditions.<sup>42</sup> First, honesty (*honestly*) with honesty as a guardian of God will be trustworthy in understanding His commandments. Second, seriousness (*delligense*) tries to try and strive to be rational in responding to God's will. Third, comprehensiveness (*comperhensive*), i.e. the overall investigation of the understanding of God's will. Fourth, rationality (*reasonableness*), namely making an effort in studying and interpreting God's message and will. Fifth, self-control (*self-restraint*) as a reader must have humility and self-control in understanding God's will.<sup>43</sup> Khaled said that in analyzing the form of interaction between the content of the text and its historical context, a model of reading the text with a more precise and clear understanding is needed by paying attention to the relevance between the text and its history.

In addition, understanding the rules of text language in a context is none other than to understand the true meaning. However, to understand the dynamics of the text and its initial recipient. This can be interpreted that the text does not represent all the will of God and neither does the will of the author. Nevertheless, the text is able to guide God's will and the author's will. God and the author are only pioneers in the process of meaning by placing the text as the flow of interpretation, but God and the author do not regulate the meaning. The text and the reader continue to negotiate and construct. Thus, this negotiation process is a way to determine meaning.<sup>44</sup>

Hermeneutics of Fazlur Rahman and Khaled Aboue El-Fadl in Understanding Hadith of Music

حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو بَكْرٍ بْنُ أَبِي شَيْبَةَ حَدَّثَنَا أَبُو أُسَامَةَ عَنْ هِشَامٍ عَنْ أَبِيهِ عَنْ عَائِشَةَ قَالَتْ: دَخَلَ عَلَيَّ أَبُو بَكْرٍ وَعِنْدِي جَارِيَتَانِ مِنْ جَوَارِي الْأَنْصَارِ تُغَيَّيَانِ بِمَا تَقَاوَلَتْ بِهِ الْأَنْصَارُ يَوْمَ بُعَاثٍ قَالَتْ وَلَيْسَتَا بِمُغَيَّيَتَيْنِ فَقَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ أَمْزَمُورِ الشَّيْطَانِ فِي بَيْتِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ وَذَلِكَ فِي يَوْمِ عَيْدٍ، فَقَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَا أَبَا بَكْرٍ إِنَّ لِكُلِّ قَوْمٍ عَيْدًا وَهَذَا عَيْدُنَا

The above hadith explains the existence of two slave women who were singing in the house of the Prophet PBUH and at that time witnessed directly by the Prophet PBUH and his wife, Aisyah RA. However, at that time, Abu Bakr came to the house of the Prophet PBUH. He got this, which resulted in Abu Bakr commenting on the impermissibility of singing and singing, as well as the use of musical instruments in the house of the Prophet PBUH.<sup>45</sup>

### 1.1. Textual Meaning of Hadith

Aisha RA narrated that when Abu Bakr came to her, ( وَعِنْدِي جَارِيَتَانِ مِنْ جَوَارِي الْأَنْصَارِ تَقَاوَلَتْ بِهِ الْأَنْصَارُ ) while on Aisha's side there were two Ansar women who were humming what Ansar hummed in the battle of Bu'ast (the last war between the tribes of 'Aus and Khazraj which occurred five years before the hijrah).<sup>46</sup> (قَالَتْ وَلَيْسَتَا بِمُغَيَّيَتَيْنِ) And Aisha said that they were not women who were used to singing and neither were women who were famous for their humming.

The meaning of the substance of the song that is hummed is about courage, pride, victory, war strategy and tactics, also the song does not contain mafsadah that arouses lust for evil and disobedience like ignorant singers who sing with a shrill and swaying voice to provoke passion and lust.

<sup>42</sup> Sofyan, "Khaled Abou El-Fadl." Thing. 379

<sup>43</sup> Fadl, *In the Name of God from Authoritarian Fiqh to Authoritative Fiqh*. Thing. 89

<sup>44</sup> Fadl. Thing. 191-199

<sup>45</sup> Ibnu Majah, *Ibnu Majah*, 209M. No. 19898, p. 612, the book of marriage, the chapter of songs and music).

<sup>46</sup> The Prophet (peace be upon him) said, "O Prophet of Allah! *el-Ghiroh* Vol.XV. No (2018).

(فَقَالَ أَبُو بَكْرٍ أَمْرُومُورِ الشَّيْطَانِ فِي بَيْتِ رَسُولِ اللَّهِ : صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ) Immediately Abu Bakr asked, "Are the flutes of Satan sounded in the house of the Prophet PBUH?" while in his house is the place of Allah's lover who is ma'shum from sin, disobedience and negligence, and it is unethical if there is a blatant disobedience presented before the Messenger of Allah, and he will definitely deny it. But he just kept quiet, turning his face away so that the singers would not be embarrassed.

(فَقَالَ رَسُولُ اللَّهِ صَلَّى اللَّهُ عَلَيْهِ وَسَلَّمَ يَا أَبَا بَكْرٍ إِنَّ لِكُلِّ قَوْمٍ عَيْدًا وَهَذَا عَيْدُنَا)

*The Prophet replied "O Abu Baker, every people has a feast day and today is our feast day!" This shows that it is permissible to have music or entertainment during holidays or other celebrations.*<sup>47</sup>

According to hermeunetics, Fazlur Rahman, this discussion is the first movement, namely the process of understanding hadith texts. Meanwhile, according to hermeneutics Khalid Aboue El-Fadl, this discussion is part of the *author*.

### 1.2. Socio-Historical Approach (social setting and Asbabul Wurud)

The author did not find *asbab al-wurud* or the case that caused the emergence of hadith about music in this research study. Therefore, the way that the author can prove the results of his writing by listing the place and culture of the Arab nation at the time of the emergence of these hadiths is in the form of a more comprehensive macro historical perspective in order to provide a detailed understanding.

The Jahiliah Arab society is famous for its sha'irs and has the advantage of being strong in remembering. The *sha'ir* they made was the result of expressions of feelings and thoughts from within them, which contained the history of their life struggles during the war and the problems faced by the tribes. The string of words in their sha'ir that is expressed orally is not an absurd thing, it will remain as a symbol that gives a burning spirit, attracts attention and controls emotions in the midst of the upheavals of life.

Therefore, the literary tradition for the Arabs in the pre-Islamic period was as a devotion to their lives, which they expressed in various ways; for example, they would make a poem that they would then express in song, and make a fairy tale and many other things.<sup>48</sup> Wars, drunkenness, gambling and arrogance for pre-Islamic Arabs were one of the three common habits for them. They assume that drunkenness and gambling are the luxury habits of the rich. Meanwhile, for poor Arabs, this act is a way to vent fatigue and a place to free themselves from poverty.<sup>49</sup>

However, after the entry of Islam, Arabic literary works, both in terms of content and meaning, underwent a change from the aspect of their teachings to the teachings of monotheism taught by the Prophet PBUH. In fact, many ignorant poets embraced Islam and became defenders of the Prophet PBUH, such as Hasan bin Tsabit, Ka'ab bin Malik, and Abdullah bin Rawahah.<sup>50</sup> The majority of Arabs are basically capable of music. Therefore, music for the Arab people is a natural thing and has become a tradition in life. However, with the entry of Islam, the Companions preferred jihad over the call of music and songs, so it can be said that Islam at the time of the

<sup>47</sup> Imam Allama Muhyiddin Abi Zakaria Yahya Sharaf Al-Nawawi, *Sahih Muslim explaining the nuclear, Edition (Egypt: Egyptian Press in Al-Arhar, 1929).*

<sup>48</sup> Wahyu Iriana, *Islamic historiography* (Jakarta: Kencana, 2021).

<sup>49</sup> Ahmad Riyadh Maulidi et al., "The Ability of the Prophet Muhammad (saw) to Change the Environment of the Jahiliyah Arab Society: A Review of Educational Psychology," *Journal of Psychology* 4, no. 1 (2022): 65–83.

<sup>50</sup> Khairawati, "The Influence of Islam on Arabic Literature," *Archive Repository*, 2012, 1–11.



Prophet was still in a narrow scope. Eventually, Islam spread and Muslim communities mingled with the population of various countries and paid attention to their traditions and culture, thus beginning the openness of these Muslims in the field of art.<sup>51</sup>

Basically, the scholars forbid music, as stated in the hadith:

وقال هشام بن عمار حدثنا صدقة بن خالد حدثنا عبد الرحمن بن يزيد بن جابر حدثنا عطية بن قيس الكالبي حدثنا عبد الرحمن بن غنم الأشعري قال حدثني أبو عامر أو أبو مالك الأشعري وهلالا ما كذبني سمع النبي صلى هلالا عليه وسلم يقول ليكون من أمتي أقوام يستحلون الحر والحرير والخمر والمعازف ولينزلن أقوام إلى جنب علم يروح عليه بسارحة لهم يأتيهم يعني الفقير لحاجة فيقولوا ارجع إلينا غدا فيبيتهم هلالا ويضع العلم ويمسخ آخرين قردة وخنازير إلى يوم القيامة (رواه البخاري

*This hadith is sabih, because it can be seen from its narration that is mutawatir. The hadith explains that the Prophet Muhammad PBUH has said that at some point, his people will label adultery, drinking, and splurging in which there is singing and the use of musical instruments. Then, when some of them did this activity on the mountain, it made Allah angry and punished them by turning them into pigs and monkeys. This means that their nature and behaviour could be made by Allah, like the behaviour of pigs and apes (Sabih Buhari, Pg. 174, No. 5275, Book of Drinks, Chapter khamar).*

The prohibition of music occurs because in a meeting where there is music, there are seeds of disobedience, such as adultery, drinking (khamar) and extravagant. Then, from these deeds, Allah threatens them to be crushed by mountains and make them like apes or pigs, it can be interpreted that Allah will make themselves have dispositions and deeds like monkeys and pigs

This hadith is considered to be a hadith that has been interrupted by its sanad, which is due to a quote by Bukhari. However, it does not mean that there is an absolute and maudu decision of sanad. Kemu'allaq in this isnad, because Bukhari and Hisham bin 'Ammar did not meet. Ibn Hajar stated that in this hadith there is ta'liq in the chain of sanad. However, this hadith remains in the status of Saheeh, because it can be seen from the clarity of the sanad, both from the path of the sanad itself and from others. The continuity of his sanad can be seen in the Book of Taghliq al-Ta'liq by Ibn Hajar. Thus, the status of this hadith of Bukhari is saheeh.<sup>52</sup>

However, we cannot say that this hadith is an authoritarian fiqh law, which is absolutely to be implemented. However, making this hadith an authoritative fiqh law, namely humanist, phenomenological and transformative. As in the first hadith, it is explained that the Prophet allowed two enslaved people who were sitting next to Aisha to hum songs about the battle of Bu'ats. However at that time, Abu Bakr came and saw the two enslaved people chanting a song while shouting, "the flutes of the devil are listened to before the Prophet". Seeing Abu Bakr's reaction, the Prophet immediately looked at Abu Bakr while saying to let the two female slaves go. From this hadith, it can be seen that the Prophet allowed music and did not prohibit it. According to hermeunethics Fazlur Rahman, this discussion is also the first movement, namely the process of understanding socio-historical aspects. Meanwhile, according to the hermeunethics of Khalid Aboue El-Fadl, this discussion is part of the text.

<sup>51</sup> Muhammad Abduh, "Khaled M. Abou El Fadl: Towards an Authoritative Reading of the Prophet's Hadith Through Negotiative Hermeneutics"; A. Putri, "Student Perception of Hadith Music and Singing: A Case Study in the Hadith Science Study Program, IAIN Salatiga.," *The Repository of Iain's*, 2019.

<sup>52</sup> Amir Mahmud, "Music; between Halal and Haram (Ma'ani and Al-Hadith Studies)," *Majlum: Journal of Qur'an Science and Tafsir* 2, no. November (2017): 251–84.

### ***Deductive Interpretation of Hadith***

Paying attention to the current conditions, that the use of music has become widespread, even people around the world do not know music. Nowadays, music has become a need for everyone and cannot be separated in life. If we watch television, we will definitely encounter music, either when tuning movies or soap operas, *background* advertisements, as well as broadcasting singing competitions on the channel *Channel TV*, such as Indonesian Idol, KDI (Indonesian Dangdut Competition), Dangdut Academy, and so on.

Humans cannot be separated by music, because in music there is art. In this art, there is an aesthetic that can be felt. We can feel that music has a huge impact on human life, both positive and negative (Pratiwi, 2021). The positive impact that can be obtained if the music we listen to leads to good, but if the music we listen to leads to bad, it will have a negative impact.

At this time, the music that is heard by everyone not only contains life experiences, but there is also music that invites to further increase faith and piety to Allah SWT. From a religious and societal point of view, music is something that has a great influence. This is because in the process of preaching, spreading religious teachings is not only done by giving lectures from one pulpit to another, but can be done using music. As we already know, that music has been friendly to us, and from the social side music is an entertainment medium that can be a medium for conveying Islamic teachings that are light and quickly responded to by the listeners.<sup>53</sup>

If we review based on the social context of the ancient Arab society regarding the prohibition of music by the Companions, it can be said to be rational at that time and place. As previously explained, in the pre-Islamic period in Arabia, the use of music must have been associated with the existence of liquor (*khamar*) and female singers, as well as gambling. Therefore, the Companions hated music because it led to disobedience.

However, as time goes by and the entry of Islamic teachings in the land of Arabia brought by the Prophet PBUH has changed the thinking of Arab poets, even some of these Arab poets embraced Islam. Quraysh Syihab in his book entitled fatwas on religion, stated that there is no prohibition on music (songs) in Islam. This is proven when the Prophet Muhammad PBUH first arrived in the city of Medina (Yathrib); he was greeted with singing by the residents of the city. In addition, the Prophet Muhammad PBUH also gave his blessing to a song that describes happiness at the time of marriage. From these examples, what is meant by music prohibition is when in the music in the song there are words or expressions that have meanings that are not in accordance with Islamic shari'a in a song.<sup>54</sup>

Thus, if we relate it back to today's social conditions by paying attention to social conditions in the pre-Islamic or post-Islamic period, then we are encouraged to be able to understand it comprehensively. In a sense, we as readers (*Reader*) cannot be quick to say that the laws of music are absolutely haram. However, it is necessary to review the legal side regarding the use of music itself. Based on the explanation of several hadiths that have been conveyed previously, it can be concluded that the use of music can be said to be haram and mubah (allowed).

The context of music is punished as haram when the use of music is intended for disobedience, where in the music, there is a song that leads a person to neglect the hereafter and

---

<sup>53</sup> Tanty Sri Wulandari, "Music as a Da'wah Media."

<sup>54</sup> Tanty Sri Wulandari. Thing. 466

be swept away in this mortal life. Meanwhile, the meaning of musical abilities is when it is used for good and does not cause harm, namely the existence of ikhtilat and fitnah (the gathering of men and women who are not mahram with a purpose that is not in line with Islamic law). Music as a medium in preaching through the lyrics of the song has a positive impact so as to increase one's piety and faith in Allah and His Messenger. The prohibition of music by scholars is a form of caution from the impact of music itself which leads to bad things.<sup>55</sup>

According to hermeneutics Fazlur Rahman, this discussion is the second movement, which is the process of drawing the value obtained from the first movement to a more specific view and concluded and implemented in modern life. Meanwhile, according to the hermeneutics of Khalid Abou El-Fadl, this discussion is part of the *Reader* (reader).

## Conclusion

Based on the results of the interpretation of hadith regarding music using the hermeneutic theory of the double movement of Fazlur Rahman and the negotiation of Khaled M. Abou El Fadl, it can be known that the initial law of the use of music was haram, because in the pre-Islamic period the Arabs used music in which there was singing as a place to entertain themselves with the accompaniment of bad song lyrics and accompanied by drinking liquor (khamar). Therefore, seeing such social conditions, music is identified as something that invites disobedience. In fact, if we pay attention to the social conditions of society today, music is a part of life that cannot be separated. Thus, the music law is permissible if the music used does not go out of the limits of Islamic teachings and can add faith and piety to Allah SWT. This research only focuses on the law of using music in a hadith. Therefore, this research can be developed again by conducting an analysis on the text of literary works, such as poetry by paying attention to the meaning conveyed implicitly based on hermeneutic studies.

## References

- Ainurrofiq, Faiq. "Use Of Hermeneutics Double Movement Fazlur Rahman In Comprehending Hadith Of The Unsuccessful Leadership Of Women." *Journal Ushuluddin* Vol. 27 No, no. 1 (2019): 5–10. <https://doi.org/10.24014/J>.
- Alma'arif. "Hermeneutics of hadith ala fazlur rahman." *Journal of Qur'an and Hadith Studies* 16, no. 2 (2015): 243–64.
- Amiruddin, M. Faizul. "The Medina of the Prophet Muhammad." *El-Ghiroh* Vol.XV. No (2018).
- Badi'ati, Alfi Qonita. "Criticism of textual authoritarianism with a hermeneutic knife; A Study on Khaled M Abou Khaled's Thought." *INJECT (Interdisciplinary Journal of Communication)* 1, no. 1 (2016): 43. <https://doi.org/10.18326/inject.v1i1.673>.
- Dozan, Wely. "As a method of interpretation of the Qur'an (theory, tracing fazlurrahman, hermeneutics)." *El-Hikam: Journal of Islamic Education and Studies* XII, no. 1 (2019): 155–81.
- Fadl, Khaled M. Abou El. *In the Name of God from Authoritarian Fiqh to Authoritative Fiqh*. Edited by Cecep Lukman Yasin. Cet. 1. Jakarta: PT Serambi Ilmu semesta, 2004.
- Fadli, Muhammad Rijal. "Understanding the design of qualitative research methods." *Humanika* 21, no. 1 (2021): 33–54. <https://doi.org/10.21831/hum.v21i1.38075>.
- Judge, Muhammad Lutfi. "Hermeneutic-Negotiation in the Study of Religious Fatwas: A Critical Analysis of Khaled M. Abou El Fadl's Thought." *Istinbath* 19, no. 1 (2020): 27–52. <https://doi.org/10.20414/ijhi.v19i1.204>.

---

<sup>55</sup> Rahwan, "Music as a Da'wah Media in the View of Shafi'iyah," *Journal Maddah* 4, no. 1 (2022): 13, <https://journal.ibrahimy.ac.id/index.php/maddah/article/view/1725>.

- Hamzawi, Adib. "The Elasticity of Islamic Law; A Study of Fazlur Rahman's Double Movement Theory." *INNOVATIVE: Journal of Education, Religion and Culture Research* 2, no. 2 (2016): 1–25.
- Hanif, Abdulloh. "A Deconstructive Review of Khaled M. Abou El-Fadl's Concept of Authority." *Reflection: Journal of Islamic Philosophy and Thought* 20, no. 1 (2020): 25. <https://doi.org/10.14421/ref.2020.2001-02>.
- Husni, Fahrul. "The Law of Listening to Music (A Study of the Opinion of Fiqh Shafi'iyah)." *Sharia Journal* 8, no. 2 (2019): 24–48.
- Iai, Burhanuddin, Hamzanwadi Nw, and East Lombok. "Polygamy from the perspective of hermeneutics of fazlur rahman." *As-Sabiqun : Journal of Early Childhood Islamic Education* 1 (2019): 71–88.
- Indrawan, Andre. "Music in the Islamic World: A Musicological Historical Exploration." *Journal of Islamic Cultural Arts Studies* 1, no. 1 (2012): 38–54.
- Iryana, Wahyu. *Islamic historiography*. Jakarta: Kencana, 2021.
- Khairawati. "The Influence of Islam on Arabic Literature." *Archive Repository*, 2012, 1–11.
- Kurniastuti, Irine, Bayu Prayogo, dan Vinsencius. "AS A FUN LEARNING MEDIA FOR SECOND-GRADE ELEMENTARY." *IJET International Journal of Indonesian Education and Teaching* 6, no. 1 (2021): 25–38.
- Kurniawan, D S. "Hermeneutic Approach in Hadith Studies: (Theory of A Double Movement of Fazlur Rahman)." *ULIL ALBAB: Multidisciplinary Scientific Journal* 1, no. 4 (2022): 705–11.
- Madona, Hasnul Fikri and Ade Sri. *Development of Interactive Multimedia-Based Learning Media*. Cetakan Pe. Vol. 21. Yogyakarta: Blue Ocean (IKAPI Member), 2020. <http://journal.um-surabaya.ac.id/index.php/JKM/article/view/2203>.
- Mahmud, Amir. "Music; between Halal and Haram (Ma'ani and Al-Hadith Studies)." *MAFHUM: Journal of Qur'an and Tafsir* 2, no. November (2017): 251–84.
- Maja, Ibn. *Ibn Maja*, 209m.
- Maulidi, Ahmad Riyadh, Muhammad Syukri, Annisa Fadila Mardhatillah, Postgraduate in Education, Islamic Religion, and U I N Antasari. "The Ability of the Prophet Muhammad (saw) to Change the Environment of the Jahiliyah Arab Society: A Review of Educational Psychology." *Journal of Psychology* 4, no. 1 (2022): 65–83.
- Moh. Wardi. "Hermeneutics of Khaled Abou El Fadl; A contribution of thought in Islamic studies." *al-Ulum: Islamic University of Madura* 1, no. 1 (2014): 1–8.
- Muhammad Abduh, Erizka Putri Bellyta. "Khaled M. Abou El Fadl: Towards an Authoritative Reading of the Prophet's Hadith Through Negotiative Hermeneutics." *Tabdis* 12, no. 1 (2021): 116–31.
- Muhammad Yusram, Hendra Wijaya, Azwar Iskandar, and Moh. Fadli. "A Comparative Analysis of the Thought of Ibn Hazm and Shafi'i on the Law of Music." *Bustanul Fuqaha Journal of Islamic Law* 1, no. 4 (2020): 627–49. <https://doi.org/10.36701/bustanul.v1i4.280>.
- Nurmansyah, Ihsan. "A Hermeneutic Study in the Book of Al-Sunnah Al-Nabawiyah by Muhammad Al-Ghazali: An Analysis of Hadith on Singing." *Journal Al-Irfani: A Study of the Qur'an and Tafsir* 2, no. 1 (2021): 1–13. <https://doi.org/10.51700/irfani>.
- Putri, A. "Student Perception of Hadith Music and Singing: A Case Study in the Hadith Science Study Program IAIN Salatiga." *LAIN Salatiga Library Repository*, 2019.
- Qudsy, Saifuddin Zuhri. "The Contestation of Hadith Memes on the Prohibition of Music." *Journal of Hadith Studies* 2, no. 1 (2019): 23–36.
- Rahmawati, Ana. "Forms of Syntactic Interference of Indonesian in Arabic." *Ijaz Arabi Journal of Arabic Learning* 1, no. 2 (2018): 122–29. <https://doi.org/10.18860/ijazarabi.v1i2.5416>.
- Rahwan. "Music as a Da'wah Media in the View of Shafi'iyah." *Journal Maddah* 4, no. 1 (2022): 13. <https://journal.ibrahimy.ac.id/index.php/maddah/article/view/1725>.
- Raya, Iain Palangka, Keywords Thought, Fazlur Rahman, and Muhammad Arkoun. "The Thoughts

- of Fazlur Rahman and Muhammad Arkoun Ajahari." *Journal of Religious and Community Studies* 12 (2016): 232–62.
- Sayyid, Nur, Jalaluddin Rummy, Windarti Rumaolat, dan Trihartuty Trihartuty. "Systematic Review A Systematic Review of Effectiveness of Music Therapy on Depression In The Elderly." *Jurnal Ners* 15, no. 2 (2020).
- Sirajulhuda, Mohammad Hanief. "The Concept of Fiqh Ikhtilaf Yusuf al-Qaradhawi." *Tsaqafah Journal of Islamic Civilization* 13, no. 2 (2017): 255–78.
- Sofyan, Muhammad. "Khaled Abou El-Fadl." *Kalam: Journal of Religious Studies and Islamic Thought* 9, no. 2 (2015): 373–92.
- Sugianto, Sugianto. "Hermeneutics: Methods in Understanding the Hadith of Fazlur Rahman's Perspective." *Alfuad: Journal of Social and Religious Affairs* 3, no. 2 (2019): 47. <https://doi.org/10.31958/jsk.v3i2.1693>.
- Suhendra, Ahmad. "Ahmad Suhendra STAI Binamadani Tangerang." *Mutawâtir: Scientific Journal of Hadith Tafsir* 5, no. 2 (2015): 412–13.
- Suwardi, S, and M Syaifullah. "Various Hermeneutic Approaches in Islamic Studies: A Literature Study." *Acta Islamica Counsnesia ...* 2, no. 1 (2022): 51–60.
- Tanty Sri Wulandari, Muklish Aliyudin and Ratna Dewi. "Music as a Da'wah Media." *Tabligh: Journal of Islamic Teaching* 4, no. 4 (2019): 448–66.
- Taufiq, M, and Muhammad Ilham. "The Hermeneutic Thought of Khaled M. Abou El Fadl: From Authoritarian Fiqh to Authoritative Fiqh." *TAQNIN: Journal of Sharia and Law* 3, no. 1 (2021): 66–79. <https://doi.org/10.30821/taqnin.v3i01.9514>.
- Wahdah, Y A. "Hermeneutics of Fazlur Rahman's Double Movement in the Study of Hadith." *Journal of Al Quran and Hadith Studies* 2, no. 1 (2021): 30–43.
- Yusuf, Muhammad, dan Anwar Sadat. "Fazlur Rahman's Double Movement and Its Contribution to the Development of Religious Moderation." *IJISH (International Journal of Islamic Studies and Humanities)* 4, no. 1 (2021): 51–71.
- Al-Nawawi, Imam Muhyiddin Abi Zakaria Yahya Sharaf. *Sahih Muslim with the explanation of Al-Nawawi*. First edition. Egypt: Egyptian Press in Al-Arhar, 1929.